



# Changing patterns of migration from Pakistan to Germany

From fleeing persecution to seeking a better life

# Changing patterns of migration from Pakistan to Germany

From fleeing persecution to seeking a better life

by Malik Abdullah Mazhar

## **Kontakt**

Dr. Matthias M. Mayer  
Senior Expert  
Program Integration and Education  
Bertelsmann Stiftung  
Phone +49 5241 81-81564  
Fax +49 5241 81-681564  
Matthias.Mayer@bertelsmann-stiftung.de  
[www.bertelsmann-stiftung.de](http://www.bertelsmann-stiftung.de)

Titelbild: Bertelsmann Stiftung

# Inhalt

<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction .....</b>	<b>6</b>
1.1: Pakistan independence resulted in high out migration flows from India .....	7
1.2: Bangladeshi migrants in Pakistan – transit and forward migration flows .....	7
1.3: Refugee inflows from Afghanistan – strengthened irregular paths to the West .....	8
1.4: Economic migration to Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries has decreased in recent years .....	8
<b>Chapter 2: Pull factors: development cooperation, positive image,         diaspora and remittances .....</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1: German-Pakistani development cooperation plays a role in shaping Pakistanis’ image of Germany .....	9
2.2: Despite recent incidents, Germany continues to enjoy a positive image in Pakistan.....	10
2.3: Pakistani diaspora in Germany – a pull factor for religious minorities? .....	11
2.4: High per capita remittances from Germany result in false perceptions among Pakistani migrants about guaranteed economic rewards in Germany.....	11
<b>Chapter 3: Regular migration comprises a low percentage of the total         migration from Pakistan to Germany.....</b>	<b>13</b>
3.1: Education-related Pakistani immigration to Germany – an area with untapped potential .....	13
3.2: Work-related migration from Pakistan to Germany is increasing through EU residence permit .....	15
<b>Chapter 4: Refugee migration from Pakistan to Germany has increased         dramatically .....</b>	<b>17</b>
4.1: Pakistan is among the top-ten countries of origin among asylum applicants in Germany .....	17
4.2: Low levels of formal education but moderate levels of non-formal competencies among Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany .....	18
4.3: Most first-time Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany are male and under 32 years old .....	18
4.4: Most Pakistani refugees in Germany self-identify as Muslims .....	19
4.5: Protection rate for Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany has declined drastically in recent years .....	20

<b>Chapter 5: Conclusion and policy recommendations .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>References .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Annex.....</b>	<b>28</b>

## Executive Summary

In recent years, Pakistan has consistently numbered among the top ten countries of origin for asylum applicants in Germany. The number of Pakistanis who arrive in Germany every year through irregular migration channels and then file for asylum has grown dramatically: The number of first-time asylum applications from Pakistanis in Germany increased from 2,539 in 2011 to 14,484 in 2016. During this same period, regular migration associated with education, work and family reunification visas has also grown. The actual number of regular migrants from Pakistan in Germany is yet relatively small compared to regular migration from other third countries. In 2016, for example, Germany received 1,089 Pakistani students, which comprises only 1.9% of the total education-related migration from third countries in Germany. In addition, merely 395 Pakistanis came to Germany in 2016 under visa categories for highly skilled/qualified migrants, which represents only 0.6% of the total number of migrants with work-related visas in Germany from all third countries.

Due to the complexity of bureaucratic hurdles faced by highly skilled/qualified individuals in particular when undergoing regular migration, many Pakistanis rely on irregular or mixed migration channels. The historical patterns of migration from and to Pakistan have shaped the irregular migration channels currently in place that are often used by unskilled Pakistani workers seeking a better life and economic opportunity in foreign countries. Other factors such as German-Pakistani development cooperation efforts, high per capita remittances from Germany, a significant Pakistani diaspora in Germany, and Germany's overall positive image have helped make the country an attractive destination for Pakistani migrants.

In order to bring about a so-called triple win that delivers mutual benefits for migrants, their country of origin and destination country, irregular migration from Pakistan to Germany must be curbed and regular migration fostered. Achieving this outcome requires that the two countries work together in encouraging fair migration through regular channels and improving the safety of economic migrants and refugees, who face several dangers in irregular migration channels. The following policy recommendations target these goals:

Entry and residence requirements for highly skilled/qualified individuals in Germany should be improved by simplifying immigration categories and revising the language requirements that function as a significant barrier to integration. Second, job-search visas, which are currently restricted to third-country nationals who have completed studies in Germany, should be expanded to include those with occupations not requiring an academic degree. Relaxing the financial requirements for this visa category would also help ensure that skilled and/or educated individuals with potential who might otherwise not be able to meet this specific prerequisite are not turned away. With regard to refugees, easing access to the labor market and ensuring the timely recognition of their skills would help improve outcomes for all parties involved. This could be facilitated by a German-Pakistani mutual understanding agreement in which the Pakistan government's Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment provides skills recognition services that would help German authorities determine qualifications and ease migration procedures.

## Chapter 1: Introduction

Diverse patterns of cross-border mobility are an integral feature of Pakistan's history. Since its birth as a nation, the country has been marked by population movements across its borders that are driven by a variety of political, sociocultural, economic, and religious forces. These migration flows have had both positive and negative effects on its economic development and society.

This paper analyzes recent migration patterns from Pakistan to Germany and changes in their underlying factors and motivations. Around the world, people with different socioeconomic and educational backgrounds are increasingly migrating in similar directions and using the same migration infrastructures. While some are driven to flee by threat of persecution and are therefore seeking asylum, others are driven by economic reasons (Angenendt, 2017). This phenomenon of "mixed migration" is of key relevance to the patterns of migration from Pakistan to Germany.

The concept of a triple-win migration infrastructure that generates mutual benefits for migrants, destination countries and origin countries has grown increasingly popular in recent migration policy and research (Azahaf, 2015)<sup>1</sup>. Current migration structures from Pakistan to Germany do not yield this threefold advantage. Yet if properly channeled, the changing mixed migration patterns from Pakistan to Germany could foster triple-win benefits. Any such efforts in this direction require first understanding more thoroughly the drivers of migration from Pakistan, Germany's pull factors that make it a suitable destination for mixed migration flows, and the key characteristics of recently arrived Pakistani migrants and how these have changed in recent years.

The yearly migration figures from the Federal Office of Migration and Refugees (BAMF), suggests relatively low and stagnating numbers of regular migration from Pakistan to Germany in recent years, with only a few migrants recorded in the (highly) skilled/qualified immigration categories. Moreover, low-skilled young Pakistanis, who cannot meet the pre-requisites needed to participate in regular migration channels, often turn to irregular migration as their only feasible alternative. This accounts to some extent for the growing number of Pakistani asylum-seekers in Germany. However, the recent decline in demand for Pakistani labor in Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries (i.e., Bahrain, Kuwait, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, and United Arab Emirates) means that the pool of low and unskilled Pakistanis who might see Europe in general and Germany in particular, as an attractive option is growing. In addition, the established Pakistani diaspora in Germany and Pakistani perceptions of Germans and life in Germany more generally, likely play a role in attracting Pakistani migrants to Germany.

---

<sup>1</sup> For further discussion see: A Fair Deal on Talent – Fostering Just Migration Governance by Najim Azahaf, Ulrich Kober and Matthias M. Mayer



## 1.1: Pakistan independence resulted in high out migration flows from India

Since the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, Muslims in India have steadfastly defended their interests against the Hindu majority. The British, having taken heavy tolls in a six-year war and no longer able to effectively rule the colony of British India, began the decolonization process in 1946 (Jaffrelot, 2004). Ongoing security concerns across the subcontinent compelled the last viceroy to announce partition, and the nation of Pakistan came into being on 14<sup>th</sup> August 1947 (Mansergh, 1980).

In their eagerness to attain power, both the Congress Party and Muslim League Party clearly failed to account for the mass movements that followed immediately. The new leadership in both India and Pakistan failed to achieve their first policy assignment and proved unable to stop the continent from being brutally divided along religious lines (Khalidi, 1998).

Exact figures for migration flows between India and Pakistan are unknown. However, a United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) report concludes that an estimated 14 million people were displaced from their homes as a result of partition, while small-scale movements continued for the next two decades (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, 2000). From 1947 to 1951, some 6.5 million Muslims migrated from India to Pakistan, and 4.7 million people with diverse religious affiliations fled from Pakistan to India. These figures show a net gain of 1.7 million in immigrant population for Pakistan from 1947 to 1951 (Khan, 1972). This influx formed 20.9% of the total Pakistani population at the time (Prashant Bharadwaj, 2008). By the end of 1957, the migrant population in Pakistan reached up to 8.4 million (International Labour Organization, 1959).

Migration inflows from India until late 1950s, and rapid population growth during the early years burdened the struggling economy of the newly formed state, as Pakistan did not feature the infrastructure and integration mechanisms needed to create positive migration effects. However, these population movements perhaps helped create a culture of migration and openness to the phenomenon itself that continues to inform the country's self-conception.

## 1.2: Bangladeshi migrants in Pakistan – transit and forward migration flows

Due to political and economic discrimination, the province of Bengal, where the Muslim separatist movement in India was born, claimed the secession of East Pakistan, naming it the People's Republic of Bangladesh. The West Pakistan administration decided to take military action against the revolt in Bengal, which led to the 1971 war and East Pakistan's secession in order to form a sovereign country (Rose, 1990). This initiated another wave of ethnic migration towards Pakistan. An estimated 500,000 Urdu speaking people chose to keep their Pakistani nationality and left their homes to reach West Pakistan. Around 250,000 ended up stranded in Bangladeshi refugee camps, although more than 200,000 entered Pakistan using regular or irregular channels (Khalidi, 1998).

Many of these ethnic migrants transited through Pakistan, ultimately arriving in Middle East and Gulf countries, where they were able to take advantage of improved employment opportunities generated by the 1973 oil boom. Many others relied on irregular migration channels to reach an economically stable Europe as competition for jobs in GCC countries increased. As a result, a new trend of migration targeting destinations further west beyond the Gulf countries began gaining traction. On 18 June 1995, the Interior Minister of Pakistan informed the National Assembly of the arrival of an estimated 800,000 regular migrants from India and Bangladesh between 1973 and 1994 who used Pakistan only as a transit country. Only 3,393 of those migrants remained in Pakistan, while the vast majority migrated to other countries west of Pakistan (The National Assembly of Pakistan, 1995).

### **1.3: Refugee inflows from Afghanistan – strengthened irregular paths to the West**

Historical patterns of migration from Afghanistan to the northwestern areas of Pakistan date back for centuries. The most recent and relevant influx was triggered first by the Soviet invasion in 1979, then Taliban rule and later, U.S. intervention in the region. As a result, roughly 6 million Afghans have been displaced into neighboring Pakistan and Iran (Internationale Organisation für Migration , 2014). Pakistan was an attractive destination for Afghan refugees due to its geographic proximity as well as its similarities in language, culture and religion (Moghissi, 2002). According to the 2005 census, more than 3 million Afghans were residing in Pakistan who arrived after 1 December 1979 (Government of Pakistan and UNHCR, 2005 ). Between 2002 and 2005, 2.7 million refugees returned to their home country with the assistance of the UNHCR's voluntary return program. However, in 2011, the UNHCR registered 1.7 million Afghans residing in Pakistan, though this number includes only Afghans with a Pakistan validity card (Mehlmann, 2011).

The composition of the migration flow between Pakistan and Afghanistan has changed in recent years. Whereas previous movements featured entire families on the move primarily as a result of persecution under the Soviet or Taliban regimes, the more recent flow is dominated by young men who have left Afghanistan in search of better economic opportunities (Internationale Organisation für Migration , 2014).

Afghanistan is infamous for its poppy production and the associated smuggling networks that have developed across adjoining borders. These networks have also contributed to irregular cross-border movement and human trafficking (Internationale Organisation für Migration , 2014). In 2011, there were approximately 45,480 irregular Afghan migrants in Europe, most of whom had left through Pakistan before moving through Turkey, Greece and other European countries (Internationale Organisation für Migration , 2014). The flow of refugees arriving through Pakistan as a transit country has contributed to channels of irregular migration and thus fostered the mixed migration of refugees and economic migration towards Europe.

### **1.4: Economic migration to Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries has decreased in recent years**

Labor emigration from Pakistan is not a recent phenomenon. The initial trigger for major outward economic migration is associated with the oil boom of October 1973 that is specific to the Gulf countries. Western countries, by contrast, faced a crisis as oil prices skyrocketed after the GCC imposed its embargo in response to support for Israel in the war against Egypt (Macalister, 2011). The GCC countries began investing their oil revenues in infrastructure, industry and agriculture, and social services (Winckler, 1997). Pakistan, with its rapidly increasing local population and large migration influx from Bangladesh and Afghanistan, began providing for the available – mostly unskilled – labor pool in GCC countries. Between 1971 and 2016, some 9.3 million Pakistanis moved to GCC and other Middle Eastern countries in search of better economic opportunities. This number makes up 96.14% of Pakistan's total official overseas employed population from 1971 to 2016 (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2016). In 2015, a total of 946,571 people emigrated from Pakistan, marking the highest annual emigration in Pakistan's history. Approximately 55% of Pakistanis chose to opt for employment in Saudi Arabia, followed by 35% to the United Arab Emirates, 5.37% to Oman, and 1.16% to Qatar during that year (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2016).

In addition to Pakistanis, at least 53,000 Afghans with Pakistani passports were employed in GCC countries during 2010. The exact number of Pakistani and Afghans who migrated to the GCC countries through irregular means is uncertain. According to one IOM report, the Afghan government informally



indicated that more than 100,000 Afghans, many of whom possess fake Pakistani passports, are working in GCC countries (Internationale Organisation für Migration , 2014).

However, reduced government spending in many GCC countries and a growing focus on efficiency among the parastatal oil and gas firms has resulted in job losses for many Pakistanis. Labor migration levels from Pakistan to GCC countries has dropped overall in recent years and by approximately 11% from 2015 to 2016 (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2016). A significant share of these migrants are expected to seek work in European countries such as Germany.

## **Chapter 2: Pull factors: development cooperation, positive image, diaspora and remittances**

What are the major factors motivating Pakistanis to select Germany as their destination? To answer this question, this paper looks at the history of Pakistan-Germany relationships and the general perception of Germany as a country, a perception that is commonly shared by the people of Pakistan. Moreover, the role of the established Pakistani diaspora in Germany and remittances from Germany to Pakistan is discussed to determine if these factors play any role in making Germany an attractive destination for Pakistani immigrants.

### **2.1: German-Pakistani development cooperation plays a role in shaping Pakistanis' image of Germany**

Germany has been an important development partner for Pakistan since 1961 and has financed development projects worth over €2.5 billion to date (Ali, 2017). In view of Pakistan's abundant natural energy resources in Pakistan and the need for investment in the education sector following partition, German-Pakistani development cooperation has targeted these two priority areas since being introduced in the 1960s and continues to yield significantly positive results (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, 2011). Given the deteriorating health conditions among Asian countries in general, and Pakistan in particular, development cooperation has also focused on health issues since the 1980s. This includes German support in Pakistan with building the infrastructural capacity to provide efficient and fair health facilities to the general public. One such initiative, the National Health Service Academy (HSA), has become a center of excellence for graduate and postgraduate medical students in Pakistan (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, 2011). Since 2005, many development cooperation efforts have focused increasingly on good governance measures aimed at improving Pakistan's outdated administrative structures that are in part a function of the country's repeated shifts from military rule to civilian governments. Addressing the plight of displaced persons particular to the Refugees Affected and Hosting Areas (RAHA) in the crisis-ridden province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has also received considerable attention. According to a 2017 BMZ report, approximately 2.2 million people benefited from numerous programs providing health, education and infrastructure to the affected in such areas (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, 2017).

Since its inception, German-Pakistan development cooperation measures have targeted the general population in Pakistan's rural areas in particular. Indeed, Germany is one of only a few donors with an active presence involving German staff in the far-flung rural areas of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) of Pakistan (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche

Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, 2017). The physical presence of Germans and their equipment arguably has a direct impact on the image of Germans among Pakistanis as it fosters grass-roots relationships between Pakistanis and German staffers at work in such areas.

However, according to a survey-based account of perceptions of Pakistanis regarding Germany, only 37% of Pakistani youth expressed some awareness of Pakistan's relationship and development cooperation history with Germany (Mirza, 2011). Based on a sample of young students from three universities in Karachi, the survey results are not representative of the level of awareness among the Pakistani population as a whole. However, notably, 83% of the survey respondents agreed to the need to highlighting German-Pakistan development cooperation and bilateral relations, which they consider as important as relations with the United States and the United Kingdom. In addition, 61% of the respondents expressed the desire to place German-Pakistan bilateral relations higher on the agenda – over U.S.-Pakistan, or UK-Pakistan relationships (Mirza, 2011).

## **2.2: Despite recent incidents, Germany continues to enjoy a positive image in Pakistan**

Germany is highly regarded among South Asian countries in general, and Pakistan in particular (Robotka, 2011). This respect for and fondness of Germany has a historical tradition, with perceptions seemingly passed from one generation to the next. Germany was not a colonial power in South Asia, and its political rivalry with Great Britain during the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries helped foster “the enemy of my enemy should be my friend” sentiments among anti-colonial efforts (Robotka, 2011).

Germans are regarded as hard workers and German products are generally viewed to be of high quality and durability (Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst, 2013). This, combined with the aforementioned positive experience with development cooperation have helped create a positive image of Germany among Pakistanis (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, 2017). Germany has provided Pakistan both financial and technical aid in mitigating the impact of natural disasters and migration crises throughout the last two decades. Such gestures, combined with the fact that Germany has been welcoming refugees from war-torn areas around the world, have create a view of Germans and Germany as being humane and generous. The efforts of Dr. Ruth Pfau, the German doctor who served the people of Pakistan for 57 years by creating leprosy centers in 150 cities across the country have also had a positive effect on Germany's image. The recipient of countless awards and medals from both the Pakistani and German governments, Dr. Pfau was named the Mother Teresa of Pakistan before her death in August 2017 (Shera, 2017).

This broadly positive image, combined with false information about the economic incentives and better life opportunities in Germany that is exploited by traffickers and human smugglers, fuels the desire among refugees and economically persecuted Pakistanis to reach Germany and thus their willingness to do so through irregular migration channels. The distorted information peddled by traffickers and smugglers plays a significant role in the growth of mixed migration from Pakistan to Germany through irregular channels. The German Embassy's Pakistan website details the consequences of irregular migration and emphasizes regular immigration as a means of studying and then finding work in Germany. However, this information is seldom accessed by non-professionals, who rely instead on the informal reports of those irregular migrants who have reached Germany and the vicious human smugglers and traffickers who exploit them for monetary gain (German Missions in Pakistan, 2017).

There have been a few incidents leaving marks on the otherwise positive image of Germany from a Pakistani perspective. The special protections afforded the Ahmadiyya community in Germany and its

recognition as a legal entity according to public law have been viewed critically, as this means the group can conduct religious education in state-owned schools in Germany (Bundesministerium des Innern, 2017). A more recent incident that triggered negative sentiments was the detainment of a Pakistani asylum-seeker as the suspected perpetrator of the terrorist attack in a Berlin Christmas Market in 2016. It took the German law enforcement agencies 24 hours to release the falsely accused Pakistani, doing damage that may not be reversible (Baloch, 2016). Such incidents, along with increasing rejection rates for asylum applicants from Pakistan (see also section 4.5) has weighed on the otherwise positive image of Germany. Nonetheless, the number of Pakistanis choosing Germany as their migration destination continues to grow.

### **2.3: Pakistani diaspora in Germany – a pull factor for religious minorities?**

When talking about the Pakistani diaspora in Germany, it is important to mention the Ahmadiyya Muslim community. While the Ahmadiyya missions to Germany date back to the 1920s, the first successful mission was in 1949 and a mosque first established in 1957 (Kandel, 2006). In 2013, the Ahmadiyya community gained recognition as a legal entity on par with the Christian churches, which allowed them to collect religious taxes and impart religious education in the states of Hessen and Hamburg (Heimken, 2013). The Ahmadiyya community is the oldest and most established Pakistani diaspora in Germany (Ballard, 2012). Around 35,000 people, most of whom have migrated from Pakistan, recently indicated their affiliation with this minority group (Statista, 2017). Asylum applications from Pakistan in Germany reached an all-time high in 2016 at 14,484 applications, which comprised 2% of all asylum applications in Germany that year (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). Observers have suggested that this spike in numbers was a direct result of the increasing persecution of the Ahmadiyya community in Pakistan (The Persecution of Ahmadis , 2016).

Around 94,000 people with a Pakistani background currently reside legally in Germany (Statistisches Bundesamt , 2017). Whereas individuals with an Asian background make up 20.7% of the total population with a migration background in Germany, Pakistanis make up only 0.5% of this population. Compared to other immigrant diasporas in Germany, the Pakistani diaspora is thus rather negligible. That said, in 2015 alone, some 10,000 Ahmadiyya have applied for asylum in Germany, the United Kingdom and the United States combined. The growing persecution of this community in Pakistan and its established diaspora in Germany have arguably played a role in increasing asylum applications (Rabwah Times , 2016).

### **2.4: High per capita remittances from Germany result in false perceptions among Pakistani migrants about guaranteed economic rewards in Germany**

Pakistan receives a significant amount of remittances from Germany. The average annual amount of remittances from Germany to Pakistan for the past five years is US\$162.8 million (The World Bank, 2017). However, the overall remittances from Germany are very low as compared to those coming from Saudi Arabia, the United Arab Emirates, Kuwait, Oman, Qatar, the United Kingdom, the United States and Canada. For instance, Pakistan received US\$193 million in remittances from Germany in 2016, which is less than 1% of the total received remittances for that year. By contrast, Pakistan received US\$5,809 million in remittances from Saudi Arabia in 2016, accounting for 29% of the total remittances for that year. Given the fact that more than 96% of all Pakistanis living abroad reside in Saudi Arabia and the GCC countries, remittances from these countries are obviously going to be much higher (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2016). Among European Union countries, Italy, Spain and Germany account for the highest amounts in remittances (see Table 1). Pakistan's economy relies heavily

on incoming remittances from its citizens who work abroad. However, the World Bank data only includes those remittances that are processed via formal banking systems.

However, as Saudi Arabia and GCC countries have begun to downsize their immigrant labor forces, more and more Pakistanis are now trying to immigrate to Europe in general and Germany in particular. Notably, per capita remittances from Germany are much higher than those from any other country. Pakistan received roughly US\$2,053 per capita in remittances from Germany during 2016, whereas it received only US\$628 per capita from GCC countries for the same year. The stable increase in annual remittances from Germany of 19% from 2012 to 2016 perhaps plays a role in attracting growing numbers of Pakistani migrants to Germany.

**Table. 1: Annual remittances from overseas Pakistanis in specific countries from 2012-2016**

Countries	Annual remittances in US\$ million (2012-2016)				
	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
<b>Saudi Arabia</b>	2,967	3,849	4,439	5,690	5,809
<b>United Arab Emirates</b>	1,707	3,559	4,220	5,527	5,698
<b>USA</b>	1,094	871	1,016	1,303	1,330
<b>UK</b>	1,521	1,079	1,272	1,644	1,697
<b>Australia</b>	76	80	92	120	122
<b>Canada</b>	542	375	435	561	565
<b>Germany</b>	162	125	146	188	193
<b>Italy</b>	208	160	186	240	248
<b>Spain</b>	175	161	188	242	251
<b>TOTAL</b>	14,010	14,626	17,066	19,306	19,761

Source: World Bank (2017) World Bank data on remittances

## Chapter 3: Regular migration comprises a low percentage of the total migration from Pakistan to Germany

What is the share of regular migrants coming from Pakistan to Germany relative to total migration from Pakistan to Germany? To answer this multifaceted question, this chapter draws on figures for regular migration inflows driven by the desire for improved economic opportunity and quality of life.

To account for the spectrum of regular migrants from Pakistan to Germany, we look at different residency categories for Pakistanis in Germany from 2011 to 2016. The data is collated by three major residency categories, including those acquired through education-related permits, work-related permits and family reunification visas (see Table 2).

**Table.2: Categories and subcategories of residence permits held by Pakistanis in Germany**

Categories	Education related permits	Work permits	Family reunification visas
Subcategories	Bachelors, Masters, PhD, Post-Doctoral studies and other study programs	Researchers, entrepreneurs and EU Blue Card holders, and other employment	Spouse
	Language courses	Permanent residence permits	Legal partners
	Vocational training	EU residence permits	Children

### 3.1: Education-related Pakistani immigration to Germany – an area with untapped potential

Education-driven migration from Pakistan to Germany is a relatively recent phenomenon. The comparatively higher inflow in recent years can be attributed to the establishment in 2010 of the DAAD's regional office in Islamabad and its efforts to initiate student exchange programs and funding opportunities for Pakistanis wishing to pursue higher education in Germany (Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst, 2017).

The duration of student permits varies depending on individual courses and programs. However, any type of student permit allows the individual to work 120 full-time days or 240 part-time days within a year as a means of supporting their financial needs during their studies (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2013). Students can also apply for a job-search permit for a period of 6 to 18 months after completing their studies. This gives them the opportunity to find a job related to their field of study and continue their stay in Germany (Sachverständigenrat deutscher Stiftungen für Integration und Migration, 2017).

Before 2011, the number of Pakistani students in Germany was rather small (375 in 2009, and 492 in 2010 (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2009-2010)). From 2013 to 2016, the number of student permits has increased steadily at an annual rate of 15% (see Table 3). On average, some 1,009 Pakistanis came to Germany each year from 2013 to 2016 with education permits that include student permits for higher education, language training, and vocational training (see Table 2). The numbers are insignificant when compared with other South Asian countries, such as India and China. From 2011 to 2016, an average of 3,729 students from India, and 9,312 from China came to Germany for education permits every year (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). The number of Pakistanis coming to Germany with some type of an education-related permit is also very low, as compared to the total number of Pakistanis coming in a particular year. In 2015, the number of Pakistani immigrants to Germany reached a record high of 23,136 but only 1,058 of these migrants had a student permit (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2015). In the same year, more than 22.6% of Pakistani students acquired job-search permits after completing their studies in Germany. This percentage exceeds that for students coming from India (17.6%), China (17%) and other third-country nationals (14.9%) (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). The high percentage of job-search visas among Pakistanis suggests that education-related visas are a good option for young Pakistanis seeking a brighter future through migration to Germany. Indeed, these visas give them the time and opportunity to learn the language and grow familiar with local customs and culture, which, in turn, helps them find gainful employment after completing their course of study.

**Table.3: Education-related inflows from Pakistan to Germany (2011-2016)**

Categories	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
<b>Bachelors, Masters, PhD, Post-Doctoral studies, and others</b>	583	629	920	932	1028	1074
<b>Language courses</b>	1	4	3	6	15	5
<b>Vocational trainings</b>	27	16	17	14	15	10
<b>Total education-related inflows from Pakistan</b>	611	649	940	952	1058	1089
<b>Total education-related inflows from third countries*</b>	46,803	48,616	51,918	57,759	61,642	55,648

Source: BAMF (2012-2016) Migrationsbericht, BAMF (2017) Bundesamt in Zahlen

\*Education related migration figures includes: 1) student visas, 2) visas for language courses, 3) visas for vocational training

Education-related permits account for only 4.6% of total migrant inflow from Pakistan to Germany in 2015 (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2015). In 2016, the record year for Pakistani students coming to Germany, Pakistani students accounted for a mere 1.95% of the total education-related inflows from third countries to Germany.

The low numbers suggest that most educated migrants from Pakistan move primarily to countries such as the United States, the United Kingdom and Canada, where language requirements are less daunting



than those faced by immigrants to Germany. In addition, the lack of concrete information regarding studying and long-term prospects in Germany is also a factor in understanding the consistently low inflow of Pakistani students.

### 3.2: Work-related migration from Pakistan to Germany is increasing through EU residence permit

Economic migration from Pakistan to Germany through regular channels dates back to the 1970s. Data from the Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment (BEOE) in Pakistan shows consistently low numbers of registered Pakistanis employed in Germany. According to the BEOE data, only 415 Pakistanis were registered for employment in Germany from 1971 to 2017 (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment, 2017). This represents less than 1% of more than 9 million overseas employed Pakistanis and suggests that there are discrepancies in the data captured on overseas employed Pakistanis, which does not also corroborate the data on remittances received per year (see section 2.4).

The numbers of Pakistanis with some sort of work permit in Germany, mainly specific to the (highly) skilled/qualified, is very low as compared to other third-country nationals such as India and China. In 2016, 5,745 Indians and 3,268 Chinese came to Germany with different categories of work permits, while only 395 skilled or educated Pakistanis came to Germany under work-related visas. Despite a 90% increase in work-related inflows from Pakistan to Germany from 2011 to 2016, the absolute numbers remain low. In 2011, 207 Pakistanis arrived in Germany under one of the work-related visa categories, and the numbers increased to 395 for 2016. A contribution to this change has also been made by the availability of EU residence permits,<sup>2</sup> which increased from 55 in 2011, to 202 in 2016 (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). However, it remains unclear whether Pakistanis with EU residence permits are highly skilled/qualified. Overall, migration from Pakistan to Germany increased more than threefold between 2011 and 2015.

**Table.4: Work-related inflows from Pakistan to Germany (2011-2016)**

Categories	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
<b>Researchers, entrepreneurs, EU Blue Card holders and other employment visas</b>	109	99	100	103	108	148
<b>Permanent residence permits</b>	43	30	37	29	42	45
<b>EU residence permits</b>	55	99	138	194	197	202
<b>Total from Pakistan in Germany</b>	207	228	275	326	347	395
<b>Total from third countries in Germany*</b>	390,166	49,721	45,532	52,599	56,352	69,247

Source: BAMF (2012-2016) Migrationsbericht, BAMF (2017) Bundesamt in Zahlen

\*Author calculated these figures by adding up individual figures from third-countries from year 2011 to 2016 under: 1) Employment, 2) Residence permit, 3) EU right to stay

<sup>2</sup> EU residence permits are usually issued to family members of EU-citizens or of citizens of the European Economic Community.

Migration with permanent residence permits have more or less stayed the same between 2011 and 2016, with an average of 37 permits each year. This is a significantly lower number compared to the overall increase of 9% from third-country nationals in Germany for the same time period. Inflows of skilled or educated third-country nationals with work-related permits to Germany have increased by approximately 45% from 2011 to 2016 (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). Yet in 2016, Pakistanis made up only 0.6% of the total number (69,247) of third-country nationals coming to Germany under one of the three aforementioned work permits (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016).

Thanks to the BEOE-affiliated employment promotion agencies targeting the Gulf countries, the United States and the United Kingdom, most of Pakistan's highly skilled/qualified migrants move to these countries (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2017). There are no similar promotion mechanisms in place to support the overseas employment of highly skilled/qualified individuals in Germany. This helps explain the discrepancies in BEOE data on overseas Pakistanis in Germany, since many of these migrants rely on private sources to find gainful employment in Germany instead of BEOE employment promoters. According to BEOE data, approximately 111,463 highly skilled/qualified Pakistanis found gainful employment overseas between 2011 and 2016, whereas only a few hundred found employment in Germany (Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment , 2017). BAMF data also shows low levels of highly skilled/qualified migration from Pakistan to Germany. From 2011 to 2016, a total of 667 Pakistanis qualified for either a research or entrepreneur permit or received a EU residence permit, and another 1,111 acquired some other form of an employment-related permits (see Table 4).

One contributing factor to the low levels of (highly) skilled/qualified Pakistanis migrating to Germany is the fact that the BEOE lacks information regarding available opportunities for gainful employment in Germany. In addition, the need for German proficiency at the workplace poses an additional challenge for highly skilled individuals when choosing their destination country.

Given Pakistan's growing population and improvements made in higher education, there is significant untapped potential to attract highly skilled/qualified individuals from Pakistan to Germany. If properly fostered, this migrant group could be part of a triple-win scenario creating benefits for Pakistan through increased remittances, benefits for Germany by providing skilled labor with the needed qualifications, and benefits for individual families by broadening opportunities for an improved quality of life. However, bilateral efforts must be strengthened in order to improve access to quality information that goes beyond the short descriptions available on an embassy website. In addition, both countries must do more to make migration more fair for everyone involved and address the growth of mixed migration through irregular channels, which is driven in part by the increasingly complex requirements facing moderately and low-skilled Pakistanis seeking economic opportunity abroad.

Finally, from 2011 to 2015, approximately 6,087 Pakistanis arrived in Germany with family reunification visas (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge , 2015). The numbers for this category peaked in 2014, when 1,798 Pakistanis qualified for this visa.<sup>3</sup> The number of Pakistanis arriving under this category of permit is significantly higher than those with an education and/or employment-related work permit, and thus comprises the largest share of regular migration from Pakistan to Germany for this period (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge , 2015).

---

<sup>3</sup> Family reunification permits are for: 1) family member of a German citizen, 2) family member of a foreigner living in Germany, 3) children of a foreigner, spouse of a foreigner studying, employed, self-employed in Germany (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2013).

## Chapter 4: Refugee migration from Pakistan to Germany has increased dramatically

Refugee migration accounts for the largest single share of total Pakistani immigration to Germany. In 2015, 43% of all Pakistani nationals arriving in Germany applied for asylum (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2015). In practice, irregular migration frames the experience of anyone applying for asylum in Germany or Europe more generally. Why are more and more Pakistanis filing for asylum in Germany? In addition, what characteristics define Pakistani refugees in Germany?

### 4.1: Pakistan is among the top-ten countries of origin among asylum applicants in Germany

From 1991 to 2017, asylum applicants from Pakistan accounted for a significant percentage (0.9% to 5.6% annually) of the total asylum applications in Germany. For the same period, refugee migrants have been more or less directly proportional to the total number of refugee applicants in Germany.

Since 2010, and with the exception of 2014, Pakistan has numbered among the top ten countries of origin for those applying for asylum in Germany. Average refugee migration from Pakistan to Germany increased fivefold from 2005 to 2016. Notably, the numbers of annual Pakistani asylum applications were significantly higher<sup>4</sup> from 1991 to 2000 (2,714 annual applications on average, with a peak of 5,215 applications in 1992) (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016).

**Table.5: First-time asylum applications among Pakistanis in Germany as a percentage of total asylum applications in Germany (2005-2016)**

Years	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
<b>First-time asylum applications among Pakistanis in Germany</b>	551	464	301	320	481	840	2,539	3,412	4,101	3,968	8,199	14,484
<b>Pakistani first-time asylum applications as a percentage of total first-time asylum applications in Germany</b>	1.9%	2.2%	1.6%	1.4%	1.7%	2.0%	5.6%	5.3%	3.7%	2.3%	1.9%	2.0%
<b>Total first-time asylum applications in Germany</b>	28,914	21,029	19,164	22,085	27,649	41,332	45,741	64,539	109,580	173,072	441,899	722,370

Source: BAMF (2006-2016) Migrationsbericht, BAMF (2017) Bundesamt in Zahlen

<sup>4</sup> Annex depicts the refugee migration in numbers from Pakistan to Germany from 1991 to 2005, in addition to Table.5

In 1992, a total of 438,191 individuals applied for asylum in Germany, of which Pakistanis comprised 1.2% of those applicants. However, Pakistani asylum claims decreased apace with the decline in total asylum applications in Germany. In 2007, a total of only 19,164 individuals applied for asylum in Germany, of which only 301 (1.6%) were Pakistani. However, Pakistani asylum applications reached a new high in 2015 with 8,199 Pakistanis (1.9% of total asylum applicants) filing in Germany. This was followed by 14,448 asylum applications in 2016 (2.0% of total asylum applicants). This recent inflow of refugees from Pakistan took place during the same period when primarily Syrians began arriving in Germany as refugees.

#### **4.2: Low levels of formal education but moderate levels of non-formal competencies among Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany**

Most Pakistani asylum applicants arriving in Germany in 2015 had only a general secondary level education.<sup>5</sup> Only 8.2% of Pakistani asylum applicants had attained higher education, which is significantly below the 17.8% average of all countries of origin for the same year (Rich, 2016). In addition, 11.7% of Pakistanis that arrived in 2015 said they had a high school education, while 46.1% claimed to have a general secondary education. The percentage of high school graduates among Pakistani asylum applicants is also lower than the 20.4% average among all countries of origin. The data suggests that most Pakistani applicants in 2015 had a lower education level than other origin countries (Rich, 2016). In 2015, some 4.9% of the Pakistani asylum applicants indicated that they had English language skills, while only 0.1% indicated German language skills. Indeed, in terms of German language skills, Pakistanis rank lowest among the top-ten asylum origin countries.

Among Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany in 2015, 80.9% of all males and 28% of all females reported having been gainfully employed before leaving their country of origin. Cultural issues that limit opportunities for women to work may account for the lower rate among women here. Of those Pakistani asylum applicants reporting to have been previously employed, some 18.4% had worked in agriculture, forestry or fisheries, a figure much higher than the 6.3% average for all other applicants who reported having worked in the same sector in their country of origin. Some 14.5% of these Pakistani asylum applicants reported having worked in manual trades, followed by 13.3% in private employment, and 7.8% in the service sector. These figures point to a high degree of informal competencies, often acquired through prior experience, among Pakistani asylum applicants who thus hold potential for Germany's labor market. At the same time, formal education levels among these applicants remain low.

#### **4.3: Most first-time Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany are male and under 32 years old**

The majority of Pakistani asylum applicants in 2015 were between 18 and 32 years old. Some 74.7% of all applicants to Germany for the same year were also between 18 and 32 years old, and 31.4% aged 23 to 27 years old. Among the top-ten origin countries, Pakistanis account for the highest share, as they do among all origin countries as well (24.1%) in the latter age group (Rich, 2016).

The vast majority of Pakistani asylum applicants in recent years have been men, which is a relatively new trend. As Table 6 shows, the share of first-time female Pakistani applicants drops considerably by 2015.

---

<sup>5</sup> The data compiled by BAMF in a Brief Analysis Report of 2015 based on answers to questions that cannot be easily verified. Nonetheless, the responses provided by applicants serve as an indication of general trends.

**Table.6: First-time female asylum applicants from Pakistan and other countries of origin (2011-2016)**

Years	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
<b>First-time female asylum applicants from Pakistan in Germany (absolute numbers)</b>	505	558	429	*	602	1,178
<b>Female applicants as a percentage of total first-time Pakistani applicants</b>	19.9%	16.4%	10.5%	*	7.3%	8.1%
<b>Percentage of first-time female asylum applicants from all countries of origin</b>	36.8%	38.2%	36.6%	33.4%	30.8%	34.3%

Source: BAMF (2012-2017) Bundesamt in Zahlen

\*Gender-based figures on Pakistani refugees are not available for 2014, as Pakistan was not among the top-ten countries of origin for that year.

The overall share of female asylum applicants from Pakistan has decreased from 19.9% in 2011 to 8.1% in 2016. In 2016, men comprised 91.9% of first-time asylum applicants from Pakistan (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). The share of women among Pakistani asylum applicants is fairly low (an average of 12.4% from 2011 to 2016) compared to the share of female asylum applicants from all origin countries (on average 35% from 2011 to 2016). Moreover, compared with the top-ten origin countries, female asylum applicants from Pakistan comprise the lowest annual percentage from 2011 to 2016.

The underrepresentation of women among asylum applicants is perhaps a factor of the difficulties and risks associated with irregular migration routes to Germany. Moreover, the social and cultural restraints to which women are subject significantly affect migration decisions. Nonetheless, among Pakistanis, the annual number of family reunification visas is higher than the annual average for work or study visas. From 2013 to 2016, an average of 1,544 Pakistanis arrived in Germany each year with family reunification visas. In 2014, family reunification-related inflows from Pakistan to Germany accounted for 18.8% of the total inflows (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2015). Though it might be the case that men tend to migrate first and apply for family reunification visas after having obtained the relevant permit or visa for themselves in Germany, this scenario is not supported by the data, which clearly show shifting patterns over time. Instead, the data suggest a growing trend of mixed migration through irregular channels that is marked by a high percentage of male migrants and growing numbers of family reunifications.

#### **4.4: Most Pakistani refugees in Germany self-identify as Muslims**

Pakistani refugees applying for asylum in Germany are predominantly Muslim. On average, more than 95% of Pakistani asylum applicants from 2011 to 2016 identified themselves as Muslims, some 1.6% as Christians, 2.4% as belonging to another religious group and less than 1% as “without religion” (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, 2016). It is worth noting that the 95% identified as Muslim is by no means a homogenous group; it includes the Ahmadiyya community and other religious minorities that face persecution and discrimination in Pakistan. Thus, it is increasingly difficult to use religious affiliation effectively as a factor in determining a Pakistani asylum applicant’s eligibility for refugee status.

However, such complexities play an important role in the growth of mixed migration from Pakistan to Germany through irregular channels.

#### **4.5: Protection rate for Pakistani asylum applicants in Germany has declined drastically in recent years**

Asylum applications from Pakistanis in Germany have grown in the recent years, as has the final rejection rates for Pakistani refugees in Germany. Table 7 includes the data on first-time asylum rejections and the final rejections for Pakistani refugees in Germany from 2011 to 2015. It seems likely that the number and rate of rejections must be even higher for 2016; given that the refugee inflow from Pakistan to Germany reached incomparably high levels in 2015 (see Table 7).

Although final rejections as a percentage of total asylum applications remained low until 2015, it would be misleading to use this data as a baseline in calculating post-2015 rejection rates given the complexity and sheer length of time currently required to reach a decision. Nonetheless, Table 7 does suggest a turning point in 2015, showing a dramatic fall in the protection rate for Pakistani asylum-seekers in Germany (Deutscher Bundestag, 2015). In absolute numbers, whereas 566 Pakistanis were affirmed eligible for asylum in 2014, only 197 as such in 2015. This radical reduction in the number of Pakistani asylum-seekers receiving protection in Germany suggests that while many (or: growing numbers of) applicants are not able to demonstrate their eligibility, at the same time, political pressure on administrators has grown to the extent that profiling applicants has become increasingly common. This, in turn, results in a higher rejection rate for Pakistani asylum applicants.

These developments have complicated matters for asylum-seekers with legitimate claims to protection status. The increase in mixed migration through irregular channels is a growing challenge for Europe broadly and Germany in particular. At the same time, the routes to Europe have become increasingly complex and thus more dangerous for persecuted groups.



**Table.7: Rejection rates of Pakistani asylum applicants as a percentage of total first-time asylum applications**

Years	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
<b>Total first-time asylum applicants from Pakistan in Germany</b>	2,539	3,412	4,101	3,968	8,199
<b>First-instance rejections</b>	945	1,315	1,495	1,490	3,361
<b>Final rejections (after all appeals)</b>	430	555	655	765	*
<b>Final rejections as a percentage of total first-time asylum applications**</b>	16.9%	16.2%	16%	19%	41%

Source: BAMF (2012-2016) Migrationsbericht

\*The data for 2015 is from a histogram inside BAMF Migrationsbericht published in 2016, only with percentages. The first instance rejections are calculated using percentage of rejections

\*\*calculation by the author based on BAMF figures

## Chapter 5: Conclusion and policy recommendations

Migration patterns from Pakistan to Germany have changed dramatically, particularly in recent years as growing numbers of Pakistanis in search of better economic opportunities and/or refuge from persecution are attempting to migrate to Germany. This growth can be attributed to some extent to the substantial increase in mixed migration from Pakistan to Germany that is taking place through irregular channels. Indeed, regular migration from Pakistan to Germany comprises only a minor share of total Pakistan-German migration in recent years. If these patterns continue to develop on their current course, achieving a triple win for regular economic migration and ensuring the safe passage of those genuinely persecuted seems farfetched.

Among Pakistani asylum seekers, Germany is the favored destination country. There are a number of factors that shape the broadly positive and image of Germany among the Pakistani public. Mutual development cooperation between the two countries in education, energy and sustainable economic development have fostered the image of Germany as a friendly country, especially among educated Pakistanis. In addition, German support for Pakistan in dealing with the country's internally displaced people and Afghan refugees, combined with the fact that Germany has been granting asylum to persecuted minorities since the late 1950s, has also contributed to an image of Germany as a country committed to the principles of human rights. The established Ahmadiyya community in Germany has continued to grow – particularly in recent years as members of this minority have been subject to increasing persecution in Pakistan. All of these factors, along with high per capita remittances from Germany to Pakistan, make the country a desirable destination, not only for those subject to ongoing persecution, but also for migrants seeking to flee economic oppression. Hence, the level of mixed migration from Pakistan to Germany has increased in recent years.

Those individuals who participate in regular migration from Pakistan to Germany in seeking higher education and/or better employment opportunities continues to comprise a smaller share of overall migration

movements in this context. Annual migration levels through regular channels have remained more or less constant, though there have been minimal increases in specific visa categories, such as job-search visas and EU residence permits. The relatively high percentage of Pakistanis applying for job search visas in Germany points to a strong willingness among educated Pakistanis to secure gainful employment in Germany after completing higher education. The increasing numbers of Pakistanis who migrate to Germany by means of EU residence permits are likely to be another source of skilled labor. However, it remains unclear how many Pakistanis with EU residence permits are highly skilled/qualified. Although it is the highly skilled/qualified that are likely to foster a triple-win situation, the share of Pakistanis who would be included in this cohort has remained low from 2011 to 2016.

Instead, we have seen a dramatic rise in the number of Pakistanis applying for asylum in Germany, with the number of applicants in 2015 (8,199) nearly doubling in 2016 (14,484) (see Table 5). With generally low levels of formal education and only a moderate level of non-formal competencies, Pakistanis filing for asylum claims in Germany are rarely able to take advantage of regular migration channels. The high standards, complexity of procedures and sheer number of prerequisites that are designed to attract only (highly) skilled/qualified migrants serve as a barrier to the rest. For the lower skilled young men of Pakistan in search of economic opportunity, irregular migration is thus seen as their only option. Unsurprisingly, young men under the age of 32 increasingly account for larger numbers of Pakistani asylum seekers in Germany. The current framework for migration has actually contributed to the growth in mixed migration from Pakistan to Germany. As a result, those individuals subject to persecution in Pakistan face additional challenges in acquiring asylum in Germany as the protection rates for Pakistani asylum-seekers in Germany has fallen dramatically in the last couple of years. If these mixed migration trends are allowed to grow rather than mitigated, the precious lives of an ever-growing number of people will be put at risk.

Given this state of affairs, we propose the following recommendations designed to curb mixed migration, and foster orderly regular migration among the highly skilled/qualified and genuine refugees:

**Improve the entry and residence requirements for highly skilled/qualified individuals in Germany.**

Most highly skilled/qualified Pakistanis continue to prefer countries such as the United States or United Kingdom as destination countries, most likely due to the reputation of such countries, the respective sizes of diasporas, and the fact that English is the official working language in them. Germany, by contrast, features complex and time-consuming immigration procedures for more than 50 different types of immigration with distinct criteria and conditions.<sup>6</sup> In addition, language skill requirements should be reconsidered, as this particular barrier restricts the inflow of highly skilled/qualified Pakistani immigrants to Germany.

**Expand opportunities for job-search visas.** Currently, third-country nationals who either graduate from a German university or complete vocational training programs in Germany can receive a temporary residence permit in the form of a job-search visa. A high percentage of Pakistani students file for visa extensions under this scheme. This specific category should be expanded to include those with occupations not requiring an academic degree. In addition, the financial prerequisites needed to apply for this visa (funds equivalent to 18 months of living expenses) must be relaxed and thereby make this opportunity available to a larger target population.

---

<sup>6</sup> See Hunger, Uwe and Sascha Krannich (2016). Neukonzeption der Einwanderungsregelungen in Deutschland. Münster und Siegen. FES (unpublished manuscript).

**Leverage BEOE-affiliated employment promoters in Pakistan.** The BEOE and its established infrastructure has the potential to act as a starting point in attracting more skilled/qualified Pakistanis for gainful employment in Germany. BEOE-affiliated promoters can help expedite the application process, German officials achieve a timely recognition of skills/qualifications, and match qualified Pakistanis with suitable employers in Germany. The overseas employment promoters in Pakistan can act as a helping-hand if they work together with German legislators and administrative authorities in fostering the recognition of foreign qualifications and allowing for checks to be made before an actual decision on emigration is made. These promoters can also help potential applicants whose professional qualifications may not be recognized in Germany lay out a plan to meet the specified requirements.

**Reduce barriers to the labor market for refugees.** Most Pakistani refugees who have been granted asylum in Germany are moderately skilled in specific areas and should be provided easier access to the labor market. Documenting the potentials and qualifications of the moderately skilled at the point of intake would mark a step in the right direction. The BAMF currently relies on surveys and questionnaires, which lack a valid authentication of refugees' stated education/qualification levels. Systematically documenting and evaluating refugees qualification levels from the start will help smooth their path to work in Germany.

**Do more to involve established Pakistani communities in migration structures.** Incorporating the established Pakistani diasporas into migration structures could yield several positive effects, particularly in terms of mixed migration. Improving the ties between established diaspora and Pakistan can foster the transfer of knowledge and could therefore help communicate a more realistic understanding of the challenges Pakistani migrants face in Germany, particularly when they have arrived through irregular channels. The well-established diasporas can also support newcomers with integration as they adjust to their new surroundings.

**Communicate the harsh realities of irregular migration.** Finally, much more must be done to battle the unrealistic expectations propagated among unskilled laborers facing economic deprivation in Pakistan. These individuals are vastly under informed in terms of the actual realities and complexities of irregular migration to Europe in general and Germany in particular. Pakistan and Germany must work more closely in ensuring easier access to sound information regarding regular migration channels and the dangers associated with irregular migration. The complex nature of valid information on migration to Germany renders it inaccessible to a large number of people and thereby creates ample room for misleading or outright false information about life and work in Germany to be propagated by word of mouth or illegal trafficking networks. The bits of information on the embassy website and the occasional news article – which is unlikely to be read by uneducated or economically persecuted Pakistanis – will not suffice. Without the improved communication of better information, these individuals, who increasingly comprise a larger share of migration to Germany, will continue to fall victim to the exploitive promises of prosperity propagated by traffickers and human smugglers.

## References

- Ali, M. (2017, 08 22). *The Pakistani-German relationship on international cooperation: Prospects for the 2030 Agenda*. Retrieved from German Development Institute: <https://blogs.die-gdi.de/2017/08/22/the-pakistani-german-relationship-on-international-cooperation-prospects-for-the-2030-agenda/>
- Angenendt, K. a. (2017). *Mixed migration: Challenges and options for the ongoing project of German and European asylum and migration policy*. Gütersloh: Bertelsmann Stiftung.
- Auswärtiges Amt. (2017, 08 15). *Pakistan*. Retrieved from Auswärtiges Amt: <https://www.auswaertiges-amt.de/de/aussenpolitik/pakistan/204658>
- Azahaf, K. M. (2015). Policy Recommendations for Fair Migration Governance. In *A Fair Deal on Talent - Fostering Just Migration Governance* (p. 334). Gütersloh: Bertelsmann Stiftung.
- Ballard, R. (2012). *The Ahmadiyyas of Pakistan*. Center for Applied South Asian Studies .
- Baloch, B. (2016). Released Pakistani Goes Missing in Germany . *Dawn News* .
- Bulletin of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. (1996). *Migration and Refugee Policies in the United States and Germany* . American Academy of Arts and Sciences .
- Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge . (2016). *Migration Report 2015-Central Conclusions*. Germany: BAMF.
- Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge . (2006-2016). *Migrationsbericht*. Berlin: Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge.
- Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge . (2011-2017). *Bundesamt in Zahlen*. Berlin: BAMF.
- Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge. (2013). *Bildung und Beruf in Deutschland*. BAMF.
- Bundesministerium des Innern. (2017, 11 29). *Islam in Deutschland*. Retrieved from Bundesministerium des Innern: <https://www.bmi.bund.de/DE/themen/gesellschaft-integration/staat-und-religion/islam-in-deutschland/islam-in-deutschland-node.html>
- Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung. (2011). *50 years of Pakistan-German Development Cooperation*. Islamabad: Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), Division for Afganistan and Pakistan.
- Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung. (2017, 11 24). *Pakistan-Situation and cooperation*. Retrieved from Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development: [http://www.bmz.de/en/countries\\_regions/asien/pakistan/zusammenarbeit/index.html](http://www.bmz.de/en/countries_regions/asien/pakistan/zusammenarbeit/index.html)
- Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment . (2016). *Export of Manpower Analysis*. Islamabad: BEOE.
- Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment . (2017, 12 07). *List of Overseas Employment Promoters*. Retrieved from BEOE: [http://www.beoe.gov.pk/list-of-oeeps?sort=licence\\_valid.licence\\_num&order=asc&show=active&page=1](http://www.beoe.gov.pk/list-of-oeeps?sort=licence_valid.licence_num&order=asc&show=active&page=1)
- Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment . (2017). *Number of Registered Pakistanis Processed Abroad for Employment*. Islamabad: BEOE.
- Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment . (2017, 12 06). *Report & Statistics*. Retrieved from Bureau of Emigration & Overseas Employment: <http://www.beoe.gov.pk/reports-and-statistics>

- Chatterjee, P. K. (1991). *Struggle and Strife in Urban Bengal, 1937-47: A Study of Calcutta-based Urban Politics in Bengal*. Michigan: DAS Gupta & Company .
- Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst. (2013). *Zukunft gestalten mit Pakistan*. Auswärtiges Amt.
- Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst. (2017, 12 06). *The DAAD in Pakistan*. Retrieved from DAAD Pakistan: <http://ic.daad.de/islamabad/en/19362/index.html>
- Deutscher Bundestag. (2015). *Antwort der Bundesregierung*. Berlin: Deutscher Bundestag.
- E. H. Slade - Census Commissioner, P. (1953). *Census of Pakistan, 1951*. Karachi: Ministry of the Interior.
- Federal Office for Migration and Refugees. (2013). *Studying and Working in Germany: A brochure on legal requirements of residence for third-country nationals*. Nuremberg: BAMF.
- Gazdar, H. (2003). A Review of Migration Issues in Pakistan . *Migration Development and Pro-Poor Policy Choices in Asia* (p. 31). Dhaka : Refugee and Migratory Movements Research Unit (Bangladesh) , Department for International Development (UK).
- German Missions in Pakistan. (2017, 11 27). *Welcome to Germany in Pakistan* . Retrieved from German Missions in Pakistan : [http://www.pakistan.diplo.de/Vertretung/pakistan/en/12Welcome/3\\_\\_Germany\\_\\_in\\_\\_Pakistan/0-Germany-in-PAK-\\_C3\\_9CSS.html](http://www.pakistan.diplo.de/Vertretung/pakistan/en/12Welcome/3__Germany__in__Pakistan/0-Germany-in-PAK-_C3_9CSS.html)
- Government of Pakistan and UNHCR. (2005 ). *Census of Afghans in Pakistan* . Islamabad : Ministry of States and Frontier Regions-Government of Pakistan .
- Heimken, A. (2013, 06 13). *Erste muslimische Gemeinde erhält Kirchenstatus*. Retrieved from Zeit Online : <http://www.zeit.de/gesellschaft/zeitgeschehen/2013-06/islam-kirche-hessen-koerperschaft>
- International Labour Organization. (1959). *International Migration (1945-1957)*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- Internationale Organisation für Migration . (2014). *Afghanistan Migration Profile*. Kabul: International Organization for Migration Afghanistan.
- Jaffrelot, C. (2004). *A History of Pakistan and its Origins (Anthem South Asian Studies)*. UK and USA: Anthem Press.
- Kandel, J. (2006, 08). *Die Ahmadiyya Muslim Jama'at* . Retrieved from Evangelische Zentrale für Weltanschauungsfragen: [http://www.ezw-berlin.de/html/15\\_1146.php](http://www.ezw-berlin.de/html/15_1146.php)
- Khalidi, O. (1998). From Torrent to Trickle: Indian Muslim Migration to Pakistan, 1947-97. *Islamic Research Institute, International Islamic University, Islamabad* , pp. 339-352.
- Khan, M. R. (1972). Migration Within and Across the Boundaries of East and West Pakistan. Unpublished Ph.D Thesis, The Australian National University, Canberra. Canberra, Australia.
- Khosla, G. (1990). *Stern Reckoning: A Survey of the Events Leading Up to and Following the Partition of India* . USA: Oxford University Press .
- Krishan, Y. (1983). Mountbatten and the Partition of India . *History, Vol. 68, No. 222* , pp. 22-38.
- Lumby, N. M. (1977). *Constitutional Relations between Britain and India: The Transfer of Power, Vol. VII: The Cabinet Mission, p.1*. London: Her Majesty's Stationery Office .
- Macalister, T. (2011). Background: What caused the 1970s oil price shock? . *The Guardian* .

- Mahmood, T. (2014). *Assessment of German-Pakistani Relations in Trade, Investment and Strategic Cooperation*. Berlin : Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung .
- Mansergh, L. M. (1980). *Transfer of Power 1942-47*. London: London, H.M.S.O.
- Mehlmann, I. (2011). Migration in Afghanistan-A country profile . Maastricht , Netherlands .
- Mirza, M. (2011). Pakistan's Relations's with Germany: A Historical Study. *Biztek*, p. 7.
- Moghissi, A. A. (2002). Afghan's in Iran: Asylum Fatigue Overshadows Islamic Brotherhood . *Global Dialogue* , p. 11.
- Oommen, P. C. (2016). *South Asian Migration to Gulf Countries: History, Policies, and Development* . New York : Routledge .
- Past, I. o. (1946, 05). *Cabinet Mission Plan* . Retrieved from India of the Past: <http://www.indiaofthepast.org/images/pdf/1940s/cabinetmission1946.pdf>
- Prashant Bharadwaj, A. K. (2008, 09 05). The Big March: Migratory Flows after the Partition of India . *Economic and Political Weekly*, pp. 39-49.
- Rabwah Times . (2016, 09 04). *Thousands of Ahmadis fleeing persecution in Pakistan and seeking Asylum overseas*. Retrieved from Rabwah Times : <https://www.rabwah.net/thousands-of-ahmadis-fleeing-persecution-in-pakistan-and-seeking-asylum-overseas/>
- Rich, A.-K. (2016). *Social Structure, Level of Qualifications and Employment* . Berlin : BAMF.
- Robotka, B. (2011, October ). Germany's South Asia Strategy: Implications for Pakistan . *Pakistan Business Review* , p. 15.
- Rose, R. S. (1990). *War and Secession: Pakistan, India, and the Creation of Bangladesh* . California : University of California Press.
- Sachverständigenrat deutscher Stiftungen für Integration und Migration . (2017). *Zuwanderung zum Zweck der Erwerbstätigkeit*. Berlin: Sachverständigenrat deutscher Stiftungen.
- Sattar, A. (2017). *Pakistan's Foreign Policy 1947-2016*. Islamabad: Oxford Pakistan Paperbacks.
- Sialkot Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2014). *Pakistan-Germany Trade Relations*. Sialkot : Sialkot Chamber of Commerce .
- Schechtman, J. B. (1949). *Population Transfers in Asia* . New York : Hallsby Press.
- Shera, D. J. (2017). A Befitting Farewell to Pakistan's Mother Teresa. Dr Ruth Pfau. *Pakistan Today* .
- Statista. (2017). *Anzahl der Muslime in Deutschland nach Glaubensrichtung (Stand variiert von 2005 bis 2017\*; in 1.000)*. Retrieved from Statista-Corporate Account der Bertelsmann Stiftung : <https://de.statista.com/statistik/studie/id/6521/dokument/religion-statista-dossier/>
- Statistisches Bundesamt . (2017). *Statistisches Jahrbuch 2017*. Statistisches Bundesamt .
- The National Assembly of Pakistan. (1995). *Debates: Official Report (Tuesday, 19th September, 1995)*. Islamabad : Printing Corporation of Pakistan Press .
- The World Bank. (2017, 11 16). *Migration and Remittances Data*. Retrieved from The World Bank: <http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/migrationremittancesdiasporaissues/brief/migration-remittances-data>
- The Persecution of Ahmadis (2016). *Persecution of Ahmadis in Pakistan 2016*.



- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. (2000). *The State of the World's Refugees 2000: Fifty Years of Humanitarian Action*. United Nations Commission for Refugees (UNHCR).
- Winckler, O. (1997, July). The Immigration Policy of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) States . *Middle Eastern Studies* , pp. 480-493.
- World Bank . (2017, 11 20). *Data on remittances* . Retrieved from World Bank : <http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/migrationremittancesdiasporaissues/brief/migration-remittances-data>
- Zumot, G. O. (2010). *Economic Development and Security for Afghanistan-Increasing Jobs and Income with the Help of Gulf States*. New York : The EastWest Institute .

## Annex

### First-time asylum applications from Pakistanis in Germany as a percentage of the total first time asylum applications in Germany from 1991-2016

YEAR	FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS FROM PAKISTANIS IN GERMANY	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS (%)	TOTAL FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS IN GERMANY	YEAR	FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS FROM PAKISTANIS IN GERMANY	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS (%)	TOTAL FIRST-TIME ASYLUM APPLICATIONS IN GERMANY
1991	4,364	1.7	256,112	2004	1,062	3.0	35,607
1992	5,215	1.2	438,191	2005	551	1.9	28,914
1993	2,753	0.9	322,599	2006	464	2.2	21,029
1994	2,030	1.6	127,210	2007	301	1.6	19,164
1995	3,116	2.4	127,937	2008	320	1.4	22,085
1996	2,596	2.2	116,367	2009	481	1.7	27,649
1997	2,316	2.2	104,353	2010	840	2.0	41,332
1998	1,520	1.5	98,644	2011	2,539	5.6	45,741
1999	1,727	1.8	95,113	2012	3,412	5.3	64,539
2000	1,506	1.9	78,564	2013	4,101	3.7	109,580
2001	1,180	1.3	88,287	2014	3,968	2.3	173,072
2002	1,084	1.5	71,127	2015	8,199	1.9	441,899
2003	1,122	2.2	50,563	2016	14,448	2.0	722,370

Source: BAMF (2015) Migrationsbericht, BAMF (2017) Bundesamt in Zahlen



**Address | Contact**

Bertelsmann Stiftung  
Carl-Bertelsmann-Straße 256  
33311 Gütersloh  
Germany

Dr. Matthias M. Mayer  
Senior Expert  
Phone +49 5241 81-81564  
Fax +49 5241 81-681564  
Matthias.Mayer@bertelsmann-stiftung.de

[www.bertelsmann-stiftung.de](http://www.bertelsmann-stiftung.de)